



5TH ISTANBUL SECURITY CONFERENCE 2019

BOSPHORUS DECLARATION

Hosted for the first time in 2015 and this year the fifth, the **Istanbul Security Conference** was held on the dates of **07-08 November 2019** in Istanbul at CVK Park Bosphorus Hotel under the main theme of "New World Architecture of Economy and Security" by TASAM National Defence and Security Institute (NDSI). The **Istanbul Security Conference 2019**, which became a regional and global brand, provided wide-ranging speakers and protocol participation in all disciplines from different countries and regions. All relevant authorities from Turkey was represented at the conference and all sessions were followed institutionally.

During the conference, the **Turkey - Gulf Defence and Security Forum 2019** titled as "Gulf Architecture of Power, and Economic Security" (as in previous two years, with the cooperation of Qatar Ministry of Defense, Center for Strategic Studies [QSSC]) and the **Turkey - Africa Defence Security and Aerospace Forum 2019** titled as "African Architecture of Security, and Turkey" and the first of **Space Ecosystem and Security Workshop** titled as "New Economy and Security Architecture of Space" were held simultaneously as sub-events.

Istanbul Security Conference 2019, which brings together participants from 40 countries from the USA to China and from Russia to Iran; has been an important platform for the exchange of views and ideas about Turkey-based competitive new.

In the opening speeches, developments and equations in the new security and economic architecture are mentioned. In addition, the importance of the concept of the "New Economic Security Ecosystem" was emphasized and recommendations were made on the governance of the "Neither Ally nor Enemy" concept. In the conference, in the face of this negative course of the world; all relevant topics have been thoroughly examined and questions such as, "Can new initiatives on world economy and security architecture be initiated to see how the relatively existing post-World War II order can be transformed?", "Can ideas be developed on the clues of new criteria in this area?" invited decision makers to think.

The **12th TASAM Strategic Vision Awards** have been entrusted to the successful people and institutions that have strategic vision in a ceremony held during the conference.





As a result of the conference, the following determinations & recommendations were made and it was decided to bring them to the attention of all relevant authorities and the public:

1. The concepts of power and ownership of power are changing. Therefore, it is seen that the conventional period, which is expressed as large armies, large crowds and masses of expert officers, is lagging behind and rapidly changing. In a period in which knowledge alone is of value, it is necessary to search for what the new conventional is. It is certain that unpredictable consequences will come into view when the future is met by relying on existing infrastructure. In this context, the concept of power and ownership of power needs to be questioned again on the basis of individuals, families, society and the state.
2. The distinguishing feature of today's security architecture can be defined as non-polarity. The number of actors is increasing and non-state actors along with the small states creates effect by using force. In the system, regions and subregions have come to the fore. Increased interdependence and interconnectedness with complex global networks regulate the system to some extent. All countries face new opportunities and risks in such an environment. Therefore, versatile equalization is an important need.
3. The market value of conventional economic, military and technical accumulations has been entered a period of rapid meltdown. These accumulations differ in terms of all individuals and states. It should be dwell on the what is the economic equivalent and how should be transformed of old conventional systems, armies created, defense industry materials and all other values.
4. Within the New World Economy and Security Architecture, terrorism is a phenomenon that threatens not only one and a few countries or regions but also the whole world and then again, its place and appearance changes. It can manifest itself in any geographical and social environment in any time. The ability to effectively combat terrorism requires international cooperation, such as the mutual sharing of intelligence data on related threatened areas. Cooperation is needed both culturally, intellectually, economically and politically in order to eradicate terror at its source.
5. The most fundamental problem that the world must solve about terrorism is the problem of identification of it. It is not possible to unite in the international struggle against terrorism and terrorist, whose definition and description has not been made and its framework is not clearly defined. The fact that one state's description of “terrorist organization” is not described as "terrorist organization" by another state, the lack of an international definition of terrorism and ambiguity does not serve world peace and sometimes leaves the states in a difficult position.





6. In the 21st century, also called the "Age of Micro-Nationalism", this conceptualization does not only signify to ethnic origin. Any kind of organizable difference can be expressed as micro-nationalism, like people united around crypto money. In this context, while institutional infrastructure has difficulty in capturing the transformation in every country, managing the pace of regulatory change in corporate infrastructure will determine the future.
7. In a line that includes North Africa in the South, an area up to Canada in the North is shaped as the new geopolitical center. It is clearly seen that there is very intense competition between the new and old forces in this new geopolitical area and there is a great competition of sharing in the regions staying out of this geopolitical area. Possible instability of the areas staying out of the geopolitical center need to be considered too much and an international regulation needs to be developed.
8. It is clear that “land power - sea power” competition has begun with the rise of China. It can be said that the conventional balance has changed due to the new weapons that Russia claims to have developed. In particular, it is considered that the US Navy and all open sea elements (if Russia's claims are true) become open targets.
9. Although it is known that the "land power - sea power" competition will shape the coming period, the consequences of the crises to be experienced at national and global scale is unpredictable. Countries should develop a competitive perspective by reading their weaknesses and strengths correctly.
10. In the face of across the globe competition and crises, Turkey and all countries should define their strategic inventories well and act accordingly to it. Turkey and countries need to redefine and map their strategic inventory together with conventional power, soft power, hard power and the sum of these, smart power that they accumulate.
11. It is clear that the competition arises from human nature is increasing incomparably to the past and spreading throughout the world. The earth can no longer afford this destructive institutional competition. It is obvious that the resource problem is very difficult to solve. It is seen that there is a need to strengthen the shift of destructive institutional competition into Space as an alternative field.
12. The great risk that humanity faces is the threat over to humanity and the world caused by theological dogmas and ambitions. The sub-ideologies, sects and dispositions who are the derivative of the main currents are in preparation for the “**Doomsday War**”. Unseen, futuristic originated and unreal beliefs, such as Armageddon, Crusade, Melhame-i Kübra





(Great War), Arz-ı Mev'ûd are agitating the world which is the main subject of the proxies and new generation wars. Global insecurities are becoming widespread in the world, and irrational ideas adversely affect the security of the world.

13. Nowadays, “security” is considered with the Western style/mind. However, "security" in the traditional way of thinking, was based by the Creator through “rights awareness” and mediators. Security prevails with reliability. Prophet Muhammad's most important feature is "al-Amin" and that means trustworthy person. It has been an example in this aspect and has been constitute an example in Islamic societies. Security means “internal peace”. Ensuring internal peace means establishing security. This direction should not be neglected.
14. The success of international competition in the new era depends on critical thinking and merit that provides basic regulation. These concepts, which have been valid throughout the history, should be reinterpreted in today's conditions and their contribution to the institutional infrastructure should be maximized. In the post-World War II conditions, the international system, which has been built quite idealist according to modern-day, needs to be reinterpreted on the basis of power and justice. Economic centered transformation of all sectors is the basis for ensuring the security of the future.
15. By reforming the governance mechanism and its functioning, the United Nations (UN) should be restructured to provide solutions to today's needs and problems under fair conditions. The decision-making mechanism should be inclusive of all countries and not monopolized by only five countries. The UN is becoming increasingly ineffective, especially in the post-Cold War era. Likewise, it is unable to respond effectively to the needs come off by the ever increasing and complex globalization process. The most important factor here is that the UN is not sufficiently representative and inclusive. A reform that has made in the UN organization should be made more participatory and representative of all units, particularly the structure and decision-making processes of the Security Council. Thus, the international community can contribute to the achieve of the goals of world peace, development and sustainability by making the United Nations organization more effective.
16. Great power(s)/state(s) feel good with the badness of other states and want to become hegemonic power by eliminating potential powers. The rise of China in Asia poses a danger to the US.
17. The process of shaping US foreign policy after the Cold War seems more meaningful when considered in the light of the "whether its role in global politics has progressed to a more developed, more equal, more stable, and a world that close to peace" question. This is





because the position that the US has gained in world politics after a period when global competition has ended in an uncommon way, has allowed us to ask such big questions. However, it would not be wrong to say that the answers to these questions today are negative. One of the highlights of this negative trend is the post-Cold War political elections of the United States, whose traces are in the evolution of US foreign policy.

18. One of the main reasons for insecurity is populist leaders. Nowadays, security institutions in the hands of populist leaders are not well managed and local, national, regional and global problems are experienced in the ensure of security. As seen in the example of the President of the USA, “absolute populism” behaviors constantly cause problems and damage the institutionalization.
19. In order to support the institutional infrastructure, the issue of unpredictability and contradictions management for countries should be developed with a conscious, systematic and more structured form of expertise. Authorities and experts in public administration should acquire competencies in this field.
20. With "Space", "Artificial Intelligence", "Cyber Space" and "Industry 4.0", world countries are experiencing a new era of Geographical Discoveries or a new Industrial Revolution. Countries that are not at peace with itself and do not carry their human capital to the top of the human development indices are doomed to lag behind. Countries should organize educational and budget policies accordingly to this situation. Turkey's entry into the top five countries in the context of human capital in the world is a necessity not an option.
21. While Germany is constructing artificial intelligent industrial production with a formation of 250 people; Turkey and many countries are considered to be inadequate on artificial intelligence. In case of not to train cyber anti-attack specialist, it is clear that Turkey will remain unprotected in the face of possible attacks. Nowadays, cyber security vulnerability, which is one of the most vital issues of national security, has become a huge security threat for institutions and countries. Cyber-attackers are the invisible armies of the world. It should be tried to developing measures for cyber security vulnerability from space.
22. With artificial intelligence and machine learning, it is inevitable for autonomous weapons to come down to on the field. Taking into account the inference that "the slow one loses", questions like "How will ethics and law be shaped?" and "How will the robots distinguish between allies/enemies?" should be discussed as soon as possible. Military service is shifting and transforming because of technology. "Human soldier" concept is comparing with concept of "robot soldier". It is not known how ethical and how its consequences will





be the replacement of the robot soldier to the human soldier. In order to successfully manage this transformation process, a vision and strategy plan that we can call “**digital transformation**” must be prepared. Even though technology scares people, as in the example of the invention and use of the atomic bomb, what people can do with technology should be remembered and necessary precautions absolutely must be taken.

23. It must be considered how useful Smart City designs will be to humanity. The smarter the city, the more security will be needed. Countries should be able to balance "security - innovation" and "security - freedom." Cities are the most complex systems human beings have created. A large amount of data has produced by smart cities, but the more importantly is to evaluate these data. New business and business making models will develop together with smart cities. "Data Mining" has taken its place as a new concept/ profession. There is no shortage of data collection in the world, but security problems are expected to occur because data processing and storage processes are vulnerable to cyber-attacks. A new generation of defense walls should be constituted to ensure the safety of cities.
24. Within cyber terrorism and cyber-attacks, existing **Geneva** and other international conventions are inadequate. Cyber terrorism and cyber-attacks need to be reformed in international law of war. In addition, further international cooperation should be undertaken to legally develop criminal responsibility in artificial intelligence. It should also be considered that the criminal responsibility of robots in the world of the future will gradually increase.
25. Environmental pollution and global warming are common problems of humanity. Over urbanization and population growth adversely influence environmental security in the world. In order to prevent climate change and atmospheric pollution, the international community should proceed to the crisis management stage. Attention should be paid to the implementation of the **Paris Climate Agreement** on environmental issues globally, in particular, efforts should be made to prevent environmental problems by individual and institutional contributions that NGO awareness activities will mobilize.
26. In order to eradicate terror at its source; cultural, intellectual, economic and political cooperation is needed. Ethnic and denominational conflicts should be ended, the struggle against poverty should be completed and the environment of peace and stability should be reestablished by ending hate actions and discourses. The fact that every person can equally benefit from the basic services, especially education, necessary to lead a dignified life is essential part of the path to peace.





27. As the President of the Republic of Turkey Recep Tayyip Erdogan says, Turkey will not give up its legal right in the Eastern Mediterranean seas, has one again emphasized by the Turkish participants. In this context, Turkey and the Turkish Republic of Northern Cyprus will remain carrying out to drilling in the eastern Mediterranean. It has been proposing to move from conflict to cooperation by the formula of "win-win" between Turkey and Greece, Greek Cypriot Administration of Southern Cyprus and Israel. Turkey, which has the longest coast in the Eastern Mediterranean, is ready to cooperate in transferring the hydrocarbon resources to the world as well as will not give up its rights in the Aegean and the Mediterranean. Homeland is a whole with its land, sea, air and what these include. Concept of **the Blue Homeland** (Mavi Vatan), which is expressing Turkey's seas, is also indispensable to Turkey. Turkey is not in favor of conflict but of cooperation in the Mediterranean. However, the Turkish Armed Forces have the competence to protect the rights of the Blue Homeland in all conditions when it is necessary. The Turkish participants emphasized that **alliances, coalitions and joint maneuvers** in the Eastern Mediterranean region, in which Turkey and the TRNC are not included, could not go beyond rhetoric. From this perspective, it is clear that the attempt of the East Mediterranean Gas Forum (Southern Cyprus, Greece, Israel, Italy, Jordan, Palestine and host Egypt) will remain a diplomatic maneuver. Turkey needs to establish an environment in which it can express **its stance, ideas and proposals**. The impacts of **Russia, US, EU, and even increasingly China**, on regional countries should be taken into account but it should be remembered that non-regional countries pursue their interests rather than solving problems and disputes.
28. Turkey has continuously supported Afghanistan's modern state structure, management, education, military etc. establishment since 1920 and has made significant contributions to the security and reconstruction of Afghanistan through the UN and NATO platforms after 9/11. Turkey, which have the largest development assistance program for Afghanistan, has been a strong stakeholder on behalf of playing a decisive role to end the long war period and to establish peace in Afghanistan.
29. The relations between Turkey and Qatar based on rooted historical fellowship. Turkey and Qatar are fair and foul weather friends and that friendly ties will be further strengthened. In the current environment, the future of the two countries appears to be in common. Qatar people will never forget that Turkey takes place in side of Qatar people in their difficult times. Turkey's security and stability have the same meaning for Qatar. Again, Qatar has been on Turkey's side before anyone in many international issues in the past years.
30. It has been analyzed with experience that the Kurds in Iran, Iraq, Syria and Turkey cannot be terrorized through their beliefs. Turkey narrows the socio-political and socio-psychological sphere of terror in the region with the operations of the Euphrates Shield, the





Olive Branch and the Peace Spring. What happened in the Middle East over the last decade and its impact on Europe, and the conclusion that it is clearly seen that the inference that *"European security and NATO's reputation starts at the border with Turkey"* implies a phenomenon beyond rhetoric. Turkey, which is a barrier to passage to Europe while hosting more than four million refugees, has spent forty billion dollars for refugees so far, but it is obviously unsustainable. EU must review its political and economic approach to reduce Turkey's burden.

31. In mixed environments where the enemy can mix traditional skills with the unfamiliar asymmetric and clever ones, both the Euphrates Shield and the Olive Branch Operation proves that modern conventional armies can be operationally effective but strategically unsuccessful when fighting against non-state actors. As in the US military experience in Afghanistan and Iraq, it can be operationally effective but strategically unsuccessful. In addition, as in the Israeli-Hezbollah conflict in 2006, it can be operationally ineffective but strategically successful. Thus, the operational and strategic effectiveness of modern armies should be assessed separately and carefully.
32. The attack on Aramco facilities has been an alarm for states that need an air defense solution with revolutionary capabilities in Air Defense Systems (ADS). The Armed Unmanned Aerial Vehicle (UCAV) attacks on Saudi oil facilities have demonstrated the new level of threat posed by changes in the nature of the war in Middle East energy transport security to global energy resources and the global economy.
33. Asymmetric attacks are increasing day by day. The fact that technological and military expenditures have a large share in the budget expenditures of the countries and the presence of anti-A/UAV facilities are not sufficient to minimize the security threats. The mind (intelligence) is the thing that will solve the problems. Conventional forces - military expenditures are not the solution to terrorism and asymmetric attacks, and also mind and personnel are maintaining its importance. Although it is not possible to provide one hundred percent security of strategic/critical facilities, each country's approach to critical infrastructure security regime is different. Experts that trained against asymmetric attacks, should develop a system and the terror potential of individuals should be predicted. Centers such as "Strategic Foresight and Scenario Development and Planning Center" which was established by the USA, should be established and expanded by other countries.
34. The change and complexity of the threat environment necessitates the multidimensionality of the response. So, it is particularly important to respond to today's hybrid problems with hybrid security structures that can be used flexibly in terms of threats and time.

November 8, 2019, İstanbul

